

## **8 DCSE2005/0064/F - ALTERATIONS AND PARTIAL RECONSTRUCTION OF THE STABLE BLOCK FOR THE PROVISION OF 3 NO. HOLIDAY COTTAGES, NEWTON FARM, WELSH NEWTON, MONMOUTH, NP25 3RN**

**For: Mr. & Mrs. J. Gilling per M. John Crowther & Associates, Suite 2, Cobb House, 82 Newport Road, Caldicot, NP26 4BR**

**Date Received: 11th January, 2005    Ward: Llangarron    Grid Ref: 50016, 17872**

**Expiry Date: 8th March, 2005**

Local Member:    Councillor Mrs. J.A. Hyde

### **1. Site Description and Proposal**

- 1.1 The site is located at Welsh Newton which is a small settlement located on the east side of the Class I A466 in the extreme south of the County. The site itself is just to the south east of the settlement and is approached by an unmade track.
- 1.2 The proposal relates to a single storey brick structure for which planning permission was granted in 2002 for conversion into three holiday cottages. Recently a significant part of the building was demolished and new foundation work commenced. This application seeks to regularise the work.

### **2. Policies**

#### **2.1 Planning Policy Guidance/Statements**

PPG.1	-	General Policy and Principles
PPG.15	-	Planning and the Historic Environment
PPS.7	-	Sustainable Development in Rural Areas

#### **2.2 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan**

Policy CTC.2	-	Area of Great Landscape Value
Policy CTC.7	-	Development and Features of Historic and Architectural Importance
Policy CTC.9	-	Development Requirements
Policy CTC.14	-	Criteria for the Conversion of Buildings in Rural Areas
Policy H.16A	-	Development Criteria
Policy H.20	-	Residential Development in Open Countryside

#### **2.3 South Herefordshire District Local Plan**

Policy GD.1	-	General Development Criteria
Policy C.1	-	Development within Open Countryside
Policy C.8	-	Development within Area of Great Landscape Value
Policy C.29	-	Setting of a Listed Building
Policy C.36	-	Re-use and Adaptation of Rural Buildings

- Policy C.37 - Conversion of Rural Buildings to Residential Use
- Policy SH.11 - Housing in the Countryside
- Policy SH.24 - Conversion of Rural Buildings

#### 2.4 Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan (Revised Deposit Draft)

- Policy H.7 - Housing in the Countryside outside Settlements
- Policy H.14 - Re-using Previously Developed Land and Buildings
- Policy HBA.4 - Setting of Listed Buildings
- Policy HBA.12 - Re-use of Rural Buildings
- Policy HBA.13 - Re-use of Rural Buildings for Residential Purposes
- Policy LA.2 - Landscape Character and Areas Least Resilient to Change
- Policy DR.1 - Design

#### 2.5 Supplementary Planning Guidance

Re-use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings

### 3. Planning History

- 3.1 There have been a considerable number of applications with respect to Newton Farm. The following are those most directly relevant to this proposal:

- |                            |  |   |                   |
|----------------------------|--|---|-------------------|
| SH890603PF)<br>SH890604LA) | Barn to staff accommodation, part of equestrian training centre and stud | - | Approved 21.06.89 |
| SW2000/0312/O              | Equestrian centre with car parking                                       | - | Approved 11.10.01 |
| SW2000/0313/F              | Conversion of equestrian building to farmhouse                           | - | Approved 11.10.01 |
| SW2000/0314/F              | Conversion to form 6 holiday cottages                                    | - | Approved 11.10.01 |

NB. A Section 106 Agreement was completed in association with the above-mentioned permissions

- |                  |   |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|---|
| SW2002/2136/F    | Barn conversion for residential purposes  | - | Approved 13.11.02                                   |
| SW2002/3708/F    | Erection of domestic garages  | - | Approved 06.03.03                                   |
| SW2002/3712/F    | Conversion of stable block into three holiday cottages  | - | Approved 01.05.03                                   |
| DCSE2003/2909/F  | Upgrading existing access   | - | Refused 20.11.03                                    |
| DCSE2003/3063/F  | Equestrian Centre, including restaurant, staff and instructors accommodation, car parking and ancillary works | - | Refused 08.01.04 (subject of current Appeal to DoE) |
| DCSE2004/0912/RM | Proposed equestrian centre, car parking and ancillary works   | - | Refused 07.05.04                                    |
| DCSE2004/3729/F  | Conversion of existing stables into holiday accommodation   | - | Refused 29.11.04                                    |

DCSE2004/2607/RM Equestrian centre, car parking and ancillary works - Approved 17.01.05

#### **4. Consultation Summary**

##### Statutory Consultations

- 4.1 The Environment Agency has no objection subject to conditions.
- 4.2 The Open Spaces Society have no comment.

##### Internal Council Advice

- 4.4 The Traffic Manager has no objection subject to conditions. With regard to the Public Right of Way it is advised that any parking should not obstruct it nor should it be affected by the development.
- 4.5 The Conservation Manager objects as it is considered that the proposal does not meet the requirements of the Council's Supplementary Planning Guidance.

#### **5. Representations**

- 5.1 Llanrothal Parish Council object to this development. The block does not appear to be of architectural value or suitable for conversion due to the deterioration in the structure since the last application. It is outside the village boundary and the Council are concerned about setting a precedent with granting permission to build largely a new structure.
- 5.2 The applicants' agent has written in support/explanation and this letter is attached as an appendix.
- 5.3 Two letters in support has been received. These state that the Council had overlooked structural problems and that the demolition was to make the building safe on professional advice and the requirement for a further application is onerous.
- 5.4 Ten letters of objection have been received. The objections are:
- it is doubted that the building is now capable of conversion
  - the building has been largely demolished and it will be a new building
  - it will not be a conversion
  - there will be a traffic danger
  - nuisance will be caused to nearby residents
  - there will be a risk to users of the Public Right of Way
  - the AGLV will not be enhanced
  - a new building will be contrary to planning policy
  - the conversion scheme is unattractive
- 5.5 It should be noted that the consultation period expires on 14th February, 2005.

The full text of these letters can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

## 6. Officers Appraisal

- 6.1 Welsh Newton is identified in the Local Plan as a smaller settlement. However this site is to the south of the main group of dwellings and is in the open countryside. In such locations planning policy seeks to restrict new development. One exception to this is where a rural building can be converted to an alternative use.
- 6.2 This relates as originally submitted to a rural building. This essentially comprises(ed) a single storey brick structure with a corrugated metal ridged roof. Planning permission for its conversion was originally granted in 2001, into a farmhouse. This development was in association with two other permissions being the conversion of a barn into six holiday cottages and the construction of an equestrian centre. Subsequently in 2003 permission was granted for the conversion of the building into three holiday cottages. (Application SE2002/3712/F).
- 6.3 The scheme approved showed the existing brick walls to be retained and faced externally in natural stone cladding. At the time the agent confirmed that the "existing foundation and external walls are to remain repaired and underpinned as necessary and clad externally in local stone" (letter dated 25th April, 2003).
- 6.4 At some point in late 2004 the west wall of the building collapsed. In a letter, in November, outlining the event the agent enclosed a letter from a structural engineer (dated August 2004) which expressed concern as to the stability of the wall. Following its collapse, work commenced on new foundation work. The applicants were advised that as the building had been demolished by some 50% (part of the roof was also removed) that the planning permission had been lost.
- 6.5 This application seeks to alter and partially reconstruct the building. It shows one half of the building to be entirely new with the remainder to be retained. As in the 2003 permission it would be clad in natural stone.
- 6.6 The original building is of little architectural or historic merit. The approved conversion would have involved its retention although its external appearance would have significantly changed by the addition of stone cladding and a slate roof. However it did provide for a re-use of an existing building and thus be in accordance with policy. The current application in terms of the resultant external appearance would be identical to that previously approved.
- 6.7 However, it is a fundamental element of policy that buildings should be capable of being converted without the requirement for extensive reconstruction. It is regrettable that some 50% of the building no longer exists. Indeed, recently a further short section of wall on the south end has also been lost due to the effects of the weather. Having regard to the structural frailty of the building there is no evidence that the remaining sections could be retained as still envisaged. There is a possibility that the whole of the structure would be required to be replaced.
- 6.8 Whilst, as noted above, the resultant building would be almost identical in its external appearance it would effectively be substantially a new structure. It would be contrary to established policy to grant permission for new build development in this location.

**RECOMMENDATION**

That planning permission be refused for the following reason:

1. Notwithstanding that planning permission was granted in 2003 (Application SW2002/3712/F) for the conversion of the building, the proposal would result in a substantial amount of new build development. As such, the development would not be the conversion of a rural building and is therefore contrary to Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan Policies H.16A, H.20 and CTC.14, and South Herefordshire District Local Plan Policies GD.1, C.1, C.36, C.37 and TM.5, as supplemented by the Council's 'Re-use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings' and PPS.7.

Decision: .....

Notes: .....

.....

**Background Papers**

Internal departmental consultation replies.